

State of New York  
County of Fulton  
Town of Caroga

Minutes of a Caroga Town Board work session held Tuesday June 15, 2010 at the municipal building located at 1840 State Highway #10 at 7:00 pm with the following persons in attendance by Roll Call:

Supervisor Selmsler - Here  
Councilman Ralph Palcovic - Here  
Council Member Valerie Scribner - Here  
Councilman Robert Sullivan - Here  
Councilman Anthony Russitano - Here

There were 11 members of the public in attendance and a reporter from the Leader Herald newspaper.

Supervisor Selmsler noted this was a special meeting for the board to review some building issues. They need to discuss and either make some recommendations or they may not have any conclusions tonight. They may go forward with some needed repairs based on some environmental and health issues of the building. A date for a visit from the NYS Dept. of Health has not been confirmed.

Councilman Russitano has contacted several people on some repairs. He noted he is new on the board but not to commercial building. He owned five of them. He reviewed documents from 2006 – 2008 from CT Male and a document from John Fenzl. He has come to a conclusion that we need a new roof. That is where the moisture and mold is coming from. He wants to be fiscally responsible to the taxpayers. He reviewed the Spectrum report, which state the moisture is major contributor to the mold. He states that the mold problem may not go away even after abatement. Brian Correll looked at the roof. He estimates that it would cost \$29,950.00 to replace the roof. There would be a 25-year warrantee. It would be a new Genflex material. Not the Gymnasium section or the one with the stones on it, or the Kitchen. It would be the entrance and old section of the building. For another \$750.00 the town would be covered if he went out of business. Once the roof is fixed the mold has to be abated. West-air Restoration the company that cleaned the mold from the gym will be up on July 12<sup>th</sup>. He is also getting two other companies to give estimates. West – air gave a preliminary estimate of \$10,000.00 to \$15,000.00. Councilman Russitano also met with Adirondack Mechanical this morning. They suggested taking part of the Gym a – 10 x 12 area to put a new heating unit in, which could tie in from the crawl space. The estimate was for under \$100,000.00 for a high efficiency gas heating system. Removing the carpeting was recommended, address the walls, and replace all the ceiling tiles. To have clean air in the building the air should change 2 – 3 times an hour in the building. Adirondack Mechanical has a unit to do that.

Council Member Scribner asked if the roof would be the same – flat? Supervisor Selmsler noted new drains would be put in and the roof would be sloped differently. Mr. Correll would give a presentation to the board if they so wished. The drainage around the foot of the building was thought to be a problem also.

Councilman Sullivan noted that all of the problems need to be addressed at the same time. The insulation in the roof needs to be removed and replaced also. Supervisor Selmsler stated that competitive bids would need to be obtained. Any cost/expense over \$5,000.00 has to be bid.

Councilman Russitano stated it all boils down to the roof. Councilman Sullivan said you have to look at this as a total project. Councilman Palcovic said you couldn't put good money after bad if the whole problem is not fixed. Councilman Russitano thought the initial problem was the mold and the health hazards in this building. That is the current problem but it is not the only problem with the building. Councilman Sullivan stated there was no insulation in the building, energy inefficient windows, drainage, and structural deficiencies. Brian Correll did not address the structural roof joists.

Councilman Palcovic noted that bar joists – with the exception of...from the 3/21/07 report from CT Male, the quarter adjacent to the gym room and floor, floor joist at the main entrance doors, floor joist between the bathrooms, beneath the stage, and kitchen wall are bad. The CT Male estimates were thought to be inflated. Another estimate should be obtained. In an addendum to the structural evaluation report – roof joists corrosion correspond with the location of the stains on the ceiling. It is not know how many of the joists are bad.

Councilman Palcovic noted this all started with the evaluation of the roof. Then the structural problems were found. A second architectural company did an evaluation and the information was just given to Councilman Russitano. It states that the building evaluation, conditions noted by CT Male are assumed to be accurate and current based on the data.

A couple of board members have tried to contact a Morton Building representative, without a call back yet.

Councilman Palcovic noted part of the mold problem is the migration from the old section. He said the old section has to come down. It is an uninhabitable structure; air quality testing has been done over there. Before the old section can come down the services have to be removed from it, heat, electric, water, & telephone. That is why the shed was built. It has to be done in stages. The county can take it down.

Councilman Russitano did not go in the crawl space. The board noted that the moisture barrier was not put down. The area did get cleaned out.

Council Member Scribner noted there is 2010 green initiative grant money available. Supervisor Selmsler responded that those are usually a matching grant. He said there were benefits to downsizing to a smaller newer building. A 7000 sq ft building was suggested.

A member of the public was in favor of going green for the grant money. Councilman Palcovic looked into this for the firehouse. He said it adds a lot to the cost up front. There are different levels of the LEEDS Program. Very few people go for the highest certification level. The lowest certification would raise the initial construction cost 10 – 15 %. The payback is in a shorter period of time. Anything is a big savings.

Mr. Stump asked where the water goes that comes off the roof? It goes into the ground around the foundation and footings and stays there Mr. Fenzl stated. It is designed to go into a crushed stone cistern. It is near the foundation wall. There is an overflow. It was agreed that the water should be discharged away from the building. This is causing moisture in the basement. Eventually there will be erosion. The golf course is a huge aquifer. Mr. Stumpf asked how much water can the leach field handle. He states there are 6" puddles on the roof.

Councilman Russitano asked Mr. Fenzl his opinion on the corrosion. Mr. Fenzl stated there was some serious corrosion of the bar joists of the building. The end of the building is on a slab. The stains on the Gym ceiling tiles suggest it has been leaking for a long time. The roof over the

gym is OK. Mr. Fenzl thought it would be extremely expensive to start replacing bar joists. He did not recommend getting into it. Once you start there is going to be more and more. It was noted that when a historic building gets renovated they have been cared for over the years. Mr. Fenzl was told back in 2006 by then Supervisor Barker who said and he quoted, “ has leaked from the get go.” At that time they were looking at putting on a new roof. It has been leaking for over 50 years this indicates to him that there is significant structural damage. They were never able to correct it. The roof sags, the core samples were wet.

Jack Barkevich who is also a structural engineer was asked for his input. How do you determine what members need work. Once it starts rusting you start losing metal. You end up with a smaller member than you started with. Every one would have to be looked at. They can be scabbed in. It was stated that some bar joists are rusted right through. This is why the roof was shoveled in the winter. Mr. Barkevich noted that once you start work on the walls you have to bring them up to current energy code. It was not know how much insulation or what the R factor was between the cement wall and the brick.

Council Member Scribner asked what part or parts of the building should be kept if any at all. Councilman Russitano was not aware of the structural problems underneath the building. He points to the report and said this is major.

Councilman Russitano asked if there was enough square footage in the newest section of the building for offices? Mr. Barkevich who served on the citizens committee said that they produced sketches that show what can be done. They need bathrooms, heating, and the clinic space was not addressed. Mr. Heberer was given a copy of the committee recommendations. The report will be given to the board members. Mr. Fenzl pointed out the step crack in caused by settling of all of the rooms in the newest section of the building. Foot drains were suggested.

Mr. Stumpf suggested selling this building. The board wondered who would buy it with so many problems. Mrs. Holliday was in favor of a modular building. The board has 3-year-old figures on the cost to replace the building. A Morton Building was thought to be less expensive than a stick built that is why they are looking it them.

Three years ago preliminary low-end cost of construction by CT Male was estimated at \$824,000.00. It was noted on a municipal job federal prevailing wages have to be paid. The savings on the heating costs would be significant. It was noted that a public referendum was necessary to borrow money. Depending on the type of construction it would have a bearing on the amount to be borrowed. Stick built has a 20-year loan, brick is 30 years.

At this time Councilman Russitano wondered what direction to go in build new or renovate?

Councilman Palcovic wondered if by doing a partial demolition, change the pitch of the roof, add the infrastructure, where do you draw the line? He guessed at a figure of \$500,000.00. Where do we stop? The life expediency of the building was discussed. It is fifty years. It was noted that a building has to be maintained.

Councilman Palcovic asked the public what they thought. He was not in favor of spending \$500,000.00 to renovate an old building. Mr. Shutts said he would vote for a proposal only if it made sense. He wanted a firm number. At one point the project was over a million dollars. It was noted that the town is not growing.

Mr. Fenzl noted there is more chance of a cost overrun when a building is refurbished because of the unknowns.

Different options were discussed. Do we need a courtroom or should the town consolidate with another jurisdiction? Will the clinic still be a part of the municipal building? The committee recommended a long term lease if space was created for them in a future structure. The town did discuss future funding from the hospital. The board has to decide exactly what it wants/needs before they go to an architect. Mr. McLain suggested having the contractor produce an insurance policy (performance bond) on the building for labor if anything goes wrong post construction.

Councilman Palcovic suggested removing the carpeting. The board discussed removing the kitchen, gym, using just the newest section of the building. The board would need professional help to get an estimate on the cost of the project. The septic system would not need to be updated. The board members still had many questions. They will discuss this again at the next board meeting.

If the board has to put something on the ballot for the public to vote on it was noted that everything would have to be decided by the third week of September.

At the last meeting the board received a correspondence from the Caroga Museum asking for a donation of Caroga Books. The matter was not acted upon.

**RESOLUTION Donate Caroga Books to Museum #2010-055**

Offered by Council Member Scribner

Seconded by Councilman Palcovic

**WHEREAS**, the Caroga Town Board held a work session on Tuesday June 15, 2010, and

**WHEREAS**, Shirley Holliday – President of the Caroga Historical Association and Museum submitted a letter to the town asking for a donation of five or six “Caroga – A Town Recalls Its Past” books to the museum for the purpose of selling the books at the last town board meeting but no resolution was made, now therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, that the Caroga Town Board does hereby move to donate six books to the museum.

Unanimously carried

At 8:27 pm Councilman Palcovic made a motion to adjourn. Council Member Scribner seconded the motion. All board members were in favor of the motion.

Respectfully Submitted,

Linda M. Gilbert, RMC, CMC  
Town Clerk